AMOUNT \$ 2 50 SUMMONS ISSUED 1 2 LOCAL RULE 4.1 WAIVER FORM MCF ISSUED IN THE UNITED STATI BY DPTY. CLK.	ES DISTRICT COURT
NANCY S. MacDONALD)
Plaintiff, v.)))
COMMONWEALTH RECEIVABLES, INC. and CHAD E. GOLDSTONE, Defendants.	305°11136 RWZ
COMPI	LAINT MAGISTRATE JUDGE Saroker

INTRODUCTION

1. This is an action for damages brought by an individual consumer for Defendants' violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, et seq. (hereafter "FDCPA"), which prohibits debt collectors from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair practices.

JURISDICTION

2. Jurisdiction of this Court arises under 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d) and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1337.

PARTIES

- 3. Plaintiff, Nancy S. MacDonald, is a natural person residing in Arlington, Massachusetts.
- 4. Defendant Commonwealth Receivables, Inc. (hereafter "Commonwealth") is a Massachusetts corporation with a place of business in Watertown, Massachusetts, and is engaged in the business of collecting debts in Massachusetts.
 - 5. On information and belief, Commonwealth buys charged-off debts in bulk from

prior assignees of the original creditors after default for a small percentage of the amount of the debts and then attempts to collect the full face amount of the debts from consumer debtors in Massachusetts.

- 6. Commonwealth regularly attempts to collect debts alleged to be due another and is a debt collector as that term is defined in FDCPA § 1692a(6).
- 7. Commonwealth uses the mails in a business the principal purpose of which is the collection of consumer debts.
- 8. On information and belief, at all relevant times, Commonwealth was required by M.G.L. ch. 93 §§ 24-28 to be licensed as a debt collector with the Massachusetts Division of Banks in order to collect debts within Massachusetts.
- 9. On information and belief, at all relevant times, Commonwealth was not licensed as a debt collector with the Massachusetts Division of Banks.
- 10. Defendant Chad E. Goldstone (hereafter "Goldstone") is a natural person and is the President, Treasurer, Secretary and sole Director of Commonwealth.
- 11. Goldstone regularly attempts to collect debts alleged to be due another and is a debt collector as that term is defined in FDCPA § 1692a(6).
- 12. Goldstone uses the mails in a business the principal purpose of which is the collection of consumer debts.
- 13. On information and belief, at all relevant times, Goldstone was required by M.G.L. ch. 93 §§ 24-28 to be licensed as a debt collector with the Massachusetts Division of Banks in order to collect debts within Massachusetts.
- 14. On information and belief, at all relevant times, Goldstone was not licensed as a debt collector with the Massachusetts Division of Banks.

- 15. On information and belief, Defendant Commonwealth is the alter ego of Goldstone and is inadequately capitalized, does not observe corporate formalities, does not pay dividends, lacks sufficient corporate records, has no functioning directors and has only one person, Goldstone, in the position of its officers who does not function as such. On information and belief Defendant Commonwealth's dominant shareholder, Goldstone, siphons away the corporate assets and uses the corporation in promoting fraud.
- 16. Defendants represent to the public, through information listed with the Massachusetts Secretary of the Commonwealth, that Defendant Goldstone's address is 45A Flanagan Drive, Framingham, Massachusetts.
- In fact, on information and belief, Goldstone has not been at that address since 17. approximately mid-2004.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 18. On or about May 27, May 31, August 30, September 26, 2004 and March 4, 2005, Defendants mailed virtually identical form letters to Plaintiff in their attempt to collect an alleged debt to Providian Bank (hereafter "debt"). Copies of these letters are attached hereto as Exhibits 1 through 5, respectively.
- 19. On information and belief, Defendants purchased the debt from a prior assignee of the original creditor.
- 20. The debt was previously paid and settled by agreement between Plaintiff and Providian Bank, the original creditor.
- 21. Exhibits 1 through 5 are written beneath Defendant Commonwealth's letterhead and either signed or purportedly signed by Chad Goldstone as either "Legal Coordinator" or "President."

- 22. Exhibits 1 through 5 are addressed to both "Nancy S. Mac Ippald" and "Nancy S. MacDonald."
- Exhibits 1 through 5 state that "... THIS OFFICE HAS FILED A SUIT 23. AGAINST YOU IN THE BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT. In the weeks to come, you will be receiving both registered and regular mail from the BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT summoning you to appear for trial."
- 24. Exhibits 1 through 5 also each state that \$1988.84 is "due and owing Commonwealth Receivables" on the debt.
- 25. Exhibits 1 through 5 also each state, "In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience. Our representatives are willing to work with you on this matter so that your appearance in court may not be necessary. However, failure to contact this office to resolve this matter will result in our pursuing any and all remedies available."
- 26. On or about April 22, 2005, Defendants filed an action against Plaintiff in Small Claims Division of the Cambridge, Massachusetts district court in an attempt to collect the debt, alleging that Plaintiff owed Defendants \$1,969.84 plus \$40.00 court costs (hereafter "small claims lawsuit").
- 27. On or about April 26, 2005, Defendants mailed a form letter to Plaintiff, in their attempt to collect the debt. A copy of this letter is attached hereto as **Exhibit 6**.
- 28. Exhibit 6 is written beneath Defendant Commonwealth's letterhead with "Chad Goldstone" written beneath the complimentary closing and the title of "President" written beneath that.
 - 29. Exhibit 6 contains Plaintiff's name on the inside address and the name of Nancy

Mac Ippald in the salutation.

- Exhibit 6 states that \$2009.84 is "due and owing Commonwealth Receivables" on 30. the debt.
- 31. Exhibit 6 also states "In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience."
- 32. On or about April 26, 2005, Defendants mailed another form letter to Plaintiff, in their attempt to collect the debt. A copy of this letter is attached hereto as **Exhibit 7**.
- 33. Exhibit 7 is written beneath Defendant Commonwealth's letterhead and signed by Chad Goldstone as "President."
- 34. Exhibit 7 states that \$2009.84 is "due and owing Commonwealth Receivables" on the debt.
- 35. Exhibit 7 also states, "In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience. Our representatives are willing to work with you on this matter so that your appearance in court may not be necessary. However, failure to contact this office to resolve this matter will result in our pursuing any and all remedies available."
- 36. On or about April 27, 2005, Defendants mailed a form letter to Plaintiff, in their attempt to collect the debt. A copy of this letter is attached hereto as Exhibit 8.
- 37. Exhibit 8 is written beneath Defendant Commonwealth's letterhead and signed by Chad Goldstone as "President."
- 38. Exhibit 8 states that \$2009.84 is "due and owing Commonwealth Receivables" on the debt.
 - 39. Exhibit 8 also states "In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and

without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience."

- Plaintiff never received any mail from the Boston Municipal Court. 40.
- On information and belief, Defendants never filed suit against either Plaintiff or 41. any "Nancy Mac Ippald" in Boston Municipal Court.
- On information and belief, the amount \$1988.84 stated in Exhibits 1 through 5 42. included small claims court costs (at one time, \$19.00) or other unspecified charges.
- On information and belief, the amount \$2009.84 stated in Exhibits 6 through 8 43. included small claims court costs (\$40.00) or other unspecified charges.
- 44. On information and belief, none of Exhibits 1 through 8 were Defendants' "final" attempt to do anything.
- Exhibits 1 through 5 and Exhibit 7 imply that if Plaintiff contacted Defendants to 45. make payment arrangements, she would not have to appear in court and she would incur no additional costs.
- 46. In fact, Exhibits 1 through 5 and Exhibit 7 are designed to mislead debtors into failing to appear in court for the trial date and subsequent hearing dates, believing that the case is being continued because they have agreed to make payments so that Defendants can, unknown to the debtors, easily obtain default judgments and writs of execution under the informal procedures and relaxed rules of small claims court and use them as tools against debtors to force them to make payments to Defendants, depriving debtors of their day in court.
- 47. On information and belief, the last payment made on the debt was more than six years before Defendants filed suit against Plaintiff on the debt in the small claims lawsuit.

CAUSE OF ACTION

48. Plaintiff realleges paragraphs 1 through 47 above.

- 49. Defendants have violated the FDCPA. Defendants' violations include, but are not limited to, the following:
 - a. False and misleading representations of compensation which may lawfully be received by Defendants for collection of the debt, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e, 1692e(2)(B) and 1692e(10);
 - b. Collection of an amount that is not expressly authorized by the agreement creating the debt or permitted by law, in violation of FDCPA § 1692f and 1692f(1);
 - c. False and misleading representations that Defendants had already sued Plaintiff almost one year before Defendants actually sued Plaintiff, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
 - d. False and misleading representations that Defendants had sued Plaintiff in Boston Municipal Court, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
 - e. False and misleading representations Plaintiff would be receiving mail from the Boston Municipal Court in the near future summoning her to trial, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
 - f. The threat to take action which was not intended, including legal action, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e, 1692e(5) and 1692e(10);
 - g. False and misleading representations and implications as to the character, amount and legal status of the debt, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e, 1692e(2)(A) and 1692e(10);
 - h. False and misleading representations and implications that documents do not require action by Plaintiff, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e, 1692e(15) and 1692e(10) and 1692f;

- False and misleading representations and implications that Exhibits 1 through 8 are Defendants' a final attempt, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
- į. The failure to disclose in Exhibits 1 through 8 that the communications are from a debt collector, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(11);
- k. False and misleading representations and implications that Defendant Goldstone's address is 45A Flanagan Drive, Framingham, Massachusetts, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
- l. False and misleading representations and implications that Defendant is entitled to collect debts in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, in violation of FDCPA § 1692e and 1692e(10);
- Use of false, deceptive and misleading representations or means in m. connection with the collection of a debt, in violation of FDCPA §§ 1692e and 1692e(10); and
- Use of unfair or unconscionable means to collect or attempt to collect the alleged debt, in violation of FDCPA § 1692f.

PLAINTIFF'S DAMAGES

- 50. As a result of Defendants' violations of the FDCPA described above, the Plaintiff suffered actual damages, including emotional distress.
- 51. Defendants intended to cause Plaintiff emotional distress by their actions and conduct described herein.
 - 52. Plaintiff is entitled to her actual damages, pursuant to FDCPA § 1692k(a)(1).
 - 53. Plaintiff is also entitled to an award of statutory damages, FDCPA §

1692k(a)(2)(A).

Plaintiff is entitled to her costs and attorney's fees pursuant to FDCPA § 54. 1692k(a)(3).

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests that this Court:

- Enter judgment for the Plaintiff and against Defendants in the amount of her A. actual damages;
- В. Enter judgment for the Plaintiff and against Defendant for \$1,000 statutory damages pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k;
 - C. Award the Plaintiff her costs and reasonable attorney's fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(a)(3);
 - D. Grant such other and further relief as may be just and proper.

Nancy S. MacDonald, Plaintiff by her Attorney,

Ýx∕onne W. Rosmarin BBO #566428 Law Office of Yvonne W. Rosmarin

58 Medford Street

Arlington, MA 02474

781-648-4040

JURY DEMAND

Plaintiff demands trial by jury.

Commonwealth Receivables, Inc.

po box 1370, framingham, ma 01701 / tel. 508-788-9269 / toll free 888-267-6880 / fax 508-788-6938

EXTENDED HOURS: mon-fri 8:00 a.m. – 8:00 p.m. saturday 9:00 a.m. 5:00 p.m.

600837

NANCY S MAC IPPALD NANCY S MACDONALD 81 EVERETT ST ARLINGTON MA 02474

May 27, 2004

Re:

\$1988.84 due and owing Commonwealth Receivables on Providian Bank Visa Card #4479-4804-0115-4909

Our File #: C-600837

Dear Nancy S Mac Ippald:

PLEASE BE ADVISED THAT THIS OFFICE HAS FILED A SUIT AGAINST YOU IN THE BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT.

In the weeks to come, you will be receiving both registered and regular mail from the BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT summoning you to appear for trial.

In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience.

Our representatives are willing to work with you on this matter so that <u>your appearance in court may not be</u> <u>necessary</u>. However, failure to contact this office to resolve this matter will result in our pursuing any and all remedies available.

This letter and all communications from this office are attempts to collect the debt owed and any and all information obtained will be used for that purpose.

Sincerely,

Chad Goldstone
Chad Goldstone

Legal Coordinator

Commonwealth Receivables, Inc.

po box 1370, framingham, ma 01701 / tel. 508-788-9269 / toll free 888-267-6880 / fax 508-788-6938

EXTENDED HOURS: mon-fri 8:00 a.m. - 8:00 p.m. saturday 9:00 a.m. 5:00 p.m.

600837.

NANCY S MAC IPPALD NANCY S MACDONALD 81 EVERETT ST ARLINGTON MA 02474

May 31, 2004

Re:

\$1988.84 duc and owing Commonwealth Receivables on

Providian Bank Visa Card #4479-4804-0115-4909

Our File #: C-600837

Dear Nancy S Mac Ippaid:

PLEASE BE ADVISED THAT THIS OFFICE HAS FILED A SUIT AGAINST YOU IN THE BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT.

In the weeks to come, you will be receiving both registered and regular mail from the BOSTON MUNICIPAL COURT summoning you to appear for trial.

In a final attempt to resolve this matter amicably and without further costs to you, we urge you to contact this office at your earliest convenience.

Our representatives are willing to work with you on this matter so that <u>your appearance in court may not be necessary</u>. However, failure to contact this office to resolve this matter will result in our pursuing any and all remedies available.

This letter and all communications from this office are attempts to collect the debt owed and any and all information obtained will be used for that purpose.

Sincerely,

Chad Goldstone

Chad Goldstone Legal Coordinator

EXHIBIT 2 L125

Document 1-2 Filed 06/01/2005 Page 1 of 2

JS 44 (Rev. 07/89)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS44civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket

sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS O	N THE REVERSE OF THE FO	PRM.)	,			•	
I (a) PLAINTIFFS		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	DEFENDA	NTS			
Nancy S. MacI	Donald		Chad I	Commonwealth Receivables, Inc. and Chad E. Goldstone			
(b) COUNTY OF RESIDEN (EXC	NOTE: IN LAND	COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED					
(c) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NA Yvonne W. Rosma Law Office of Yvo 58 Medford Street Arlington, MA 024	rin nne W. Rosmarin		ATTORNEYS (IF	111	36 I		
II. BASIS OF JURI 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff 2 U.S. Government Defendant	☑ 3 Federal Que (U.S. Govern ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate C	ce an x in one Box onLy) stion iment Not a Party) iitizenship of in Item III)	III. CITIZENSHIP (For Diversity Cases Citizen of This State Citizen of Another State Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	Only) PTF DEF 1 1 1 Inc 2 1 2 Inc		PTF DEF ncipal Place 4 4 4 nis State rincipal Place 5 5 5	
	es unless diversity) Fair Debt Collecti	on Practices Act					
	PERSONAL INJURY 310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault Libel & Slander 330 Federal Employers' Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle 355 Motor Vehicle 70duct Liability 360 Other Personal Injury CIVIL RIGHTS 441 Voting 442 Employment 443 Housing/ Accommodations 444 Welfare 440 Other Civil Rights	PERSONAL INJURY 362 Personal Injury- Med Malpractice 365 Personal Injury- Product Liability 368 Asbestos Personal Injury- Product Liability PERSONAL PROPERTY 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage Property Damage Product Liability PRISONER PETITIONS 510 Motions to vacate Sentence Haibeas Corpus: 535 Death Penalty 540 Mandamus & Other 550 Other (PLACE AN x III		422 Apper 28 US	IC 158 rawal IC 157 Y RIGHTS ights t mark ECURITY 1395ff) Lung (923) Z/OIWW (405(g)) Title XVI 405(g)) TAX SUITS I (U.S. Plaintiff fendant) Third Party IC 7609 6 Multidistrict	-	
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: VIII. RELATED CASIF ANY	☐ UNDER FR.C.P 23	A CLASS ACTION JU	DEMAN		Litigation Check YES only if JURY DEMAN	Judgment demanded in complaint ND: ⊠ YES □ NO	
DATE May 31, 2005 UNITED STATES DISTRICT OF	Jones	JRE OF ATTORNEY OF	RECORD				

Case 1:05-cv-11136-RWZ Document 1-2 Filed 06/01/2005 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COUR. DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS Page 2 of 2

1. T	TTLE OF	CASE (N	AME OF FIRST PARTY ON EACH SIDE ONLY) Nancy S. MacDonald v. Commonwealth				
	Receiv	ables, l	nc.				
2. C	CATEGOR	RY IN WE	IICH THE CASE BELONGS BASED UPON THE NUMZERED NATURE OF SUIT CODE LISI ON THE CIVIL				
C	OVER S	НЕЕТ. (SEE LOCAL RULE 40.1(A)(1)).				
	_	I.	160, 410, 470, R.23, REGARDLESS OF NATURE OF SUIT.				
	<u>X</u>	II.	195, 369, 400, 440, 441-444, 540, 550, 625. 710, 720, 730, 740, 790, 791, 820, 830. 840, 850, 890, 892-894, 895, 950.				
		Ш.	110, 120, 130.140, 151, 190, 210, 230, 240, 245, 290.310, 315, 320, 330, 340, 345, 350, 355, 360, 362, 365, 370, 371, 380, 385, 450, 891.				
	_	IV.	220, 422, 423, 430, 460, 510, 530, 610, 620, 630, 640, 650, 660, 690, 810, 861-865, 870, 871, 875. 900.				
		V.	150, 152, 153.				
3.	None	ND NUM	BER, IF ANY, OF RELATED CASES. (SEE LOCAL RULE 40.1(E)).				
4.	has a p No	RIOR AC	TION BETWEEN THE SAME PARTIES AND BASED ON THE SAME CLAIM EVER BEEN FILED IN THIS COURT?				
5.			PLAINT IN THIS CASE QUESTION THE CONSTITUTIONALITY OF AN ACT OF CONGRESS AFFECTING THE ST? NO				
	IF SO, I	S THE U.	S.A. OR AN OFFICER, AGENT OR EMPLOYEE OF THE U.S. A PARTY? (SEE 28 USC 2403)				
6.	IS THIS CASE REQUIRED TO BE HEARD AND DETERMINED BY A DISTRICT COURT OF THREE JUDGES PURSUANT TO TITLE 28 USC 2284? No						
	COUNTY	<u>()</u> - (SEE)	IN THIS ACTION RESIDE IN THE CENTRAL SECTION OF THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS (WORCESTER LOCAL RULE 40.1(C)). YES NO OR IN THE WESTERN SECTION (BERKSHIRE, MPDEN OR HAMPSHIRE COUNTIES)? - (SEE LOCAL RULE 40.1(D)). YES NO				
8.	DO ALL OF THE PARTIES RESIDING IN MASSACHUSETTS RESIDE IN THE CENTRAL AND/OR WESTERN SECTIONS OF THE DISTRICT? YES No						
9.	IN WHI	CH SECT	ON DO THE ONLY PARTIES RESIDING IN MASSACHUSETTS RESIDE? Eastern				
	0. IF ANY OF THE PARTIES ARE THE UNITED STATES, COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, OR ANY GOVERNMENTAL AGENCY OF THE U.S.A. OR THE COMMONWEALTH, DO ALL OTHER PARTIES RESIDE IN THE CENTRAL SECTION N/A OR WESTERN SECTION N/A						
		PE OR PE S NAME_					
ADI	DRESS	Law	Office of Yvonne W. Rosmarin, 58 Medford Street, Arlington, MA 02474				
TEL	EPHONE	NO	781-648-4040				
(Cat	tegory.frm	- 09/92)					